

Working document in the series: The management of teachers

The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

Gabriele Göttelmann-Duret and Joe Hogan

A paper copy of this publication may be obtained on request from: <u>information@iiep.unesco.org</u> To consult the full catalogue of IIEP Publications and documents on our Web site: <u>http://www.unesco.org/iiep</u>

> Published by: International Institute for Educational Planning/UNESCO 7 - 9 rue Eugène-Delacroix, 75116 Paris

> > © UNESCO 1998



International Institute for Educational Planning

International Institute for Educational Planning http://www.unesco.org/iiep

This study has been prepared under the auspices of the IIEP project on 'The management of teachers' directed by Gabriele Göttelman-Duret

The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

Synthesis Report of a sub-regional workshop and four country monographs

> Edited by Gabriele Göttelmann-Duret and Joe Hogan

> Magaliesburg, South Africa 24-28 June 1996

> > Paris 1998

UNESCO: International Institute for Educational Planning in co-operation with the German Foundation for International Development (DSE) The views and opinions expressed in this booklet are those of the authors and do not necessarily represent the views of UNESCO or of the IIEP. The designations employed and the presentation of material throughout this review do not imply the expression of any opinion whatsoever on the part of UNESCO or IIEP concerning the legal status of any country, territory, city or area or its authorities, or concerning its frontiers or boundaries.

The international cost of this study has been covered by a contribution from the German Foundation for International Development (DSE).

This volume has been printed in IIEP's printshop

International Institute for Educational Planning 7 - 9 rue Eugène-Delacroix, 75116 Paris

© UNESCO September 1998

IIPE/mm

Preface

In the framework of its project on *The management of teachers*, the International Institute for Educational Planning (UNESCO), in co-operation with the German Foundation for International Development (DSE), organized a sub-regional Workshop on *The utilization, deployment and management of teachers* which was held in Magaliesburg/South Africa from 24 to 28 June 1996. The central objective of this workshop was to analyze and discuss the results and conclusions of four monographs which had been prepared on the condition and management of primary teacher deployment in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda; at the same time, the workshop was expected to give senior staff from these countries an opportunity to explore more in depth a few particularly crucial aspects of the current management strategies, tools and practices in the mentioned area.

The present document provides an overview of the presentations and debate which took place at this joint IIEP/DSE Workshop. Besides the synthesis report summarizing the major trends and issues emerging from both the country monographs and the discussions held at the workshop, it contains in its appendix the four national presentations in a slightly revised version on which most of the participants' work during the meeting was based.

International Institute for Educational Planning http://www.unesco.org/iiep

Contents

Preface		iv
Introduction		9
Section I.	Background information on Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda	11
Section II.	Current conditions, policies and challenges of primary teacher utilization, deployment and management in the four countries	15
	 Present profiles of primary teaching staff Norms and practices of teacher utilization Imbalances in the deployment of primary teachers Problems of mismatch between posts and holders 	15 18 21 23
Section III.	Information systems for teacher management	24
	 Existing information base Major weaknesses and their possible causes A possible way ahead 	24 26 28
Section IV.	Management and administrative structures — Devolution and Decentralization	30

Section V.	The rules, procedures and practices of primary teacher utilization and deployment	36
	primary teacher atmization and deproyment	50
	1. Teacher supply	36
	2. Staffing norms/standards	37
	3. Recruitment, assignment and posting	38
	4. Transfer arrangements	39
	5. Promotion to senior posts	40
	6. The annual staffing process	41
Section VI.	Some general conclusions	42
Appendices		
Ar	opendix I.	
So	me major results and conclusions of	
the	e country monographs	49
Ap	opendix II.	
Lis	st of participants	83
Aŗ	opendix III.	
Lis	st of documents	95

Introduction

The objective of this synthesis is to outline the common issues and trends emerging from both the monographs on primary teacher utilization and deployment prepared in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda, and the discussions held at the workshop; at the same time, an attempt is made to point out certain significant differences which characterize the present situation and the policies with regard to teacher utilization and deployment and the management of this process in the countries concerned. After providing some background information on the four countries and their recent educational development (Section I), the paper will present the current conditions and problems of primary teacher utilization and deployment in these countries, identifying where appropriate improvements have been made and summarizing the challenges for the future (Section II). The subsequent sections of the synthesis will focus on the issues which have been identified as crucial to managing the process more efficiently. Section III will consider the nature and extent of the *information base* presently available in the respective countries to assist in the utilization and deployment of teachers, reviewing its perceived weaknesses and identifying possible improvements. Section IV will look at the administrative structures on which different functions associated with utilization and deployment of primary teachers (recruitment, assignment, posting, transfer etc.) are based. In particular, to what extent have certain responsibilities and functions in this area been devolved to the intermediate (e.g. district), local and school levels and what has been the actual impact of these trends. Section V will then consider the rules, criteria, procedures and practices which regulate teacher utilization and deployment and through what kind of measures the management in this area has become more efficient. The final section (Section VI) will attempt to draw some general conclusions from the monographs and the workshop.

International Institute for Educational Planning http://www.unesco.org/iiep

Section I Background information on Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

Although the objective of a more rational utilization of the human resources available in the education sector is ranking high on the political agenda in the four countries, the conditions under which they are operating differ in various respects quite significantly, as can be seen from *Table 1*.

Basic indicators*										
Country	TOTALAVERAGE% URBANPOPULATIONANNUAL POPULATIONPOPULATION(1992)GROWTH RATE(1992)(1980-92)(1980-92)		GNP/ Capita (\$) (1992)	Average annual growth rate of GNP ** (1985-94)						
Botswana	1,359,000	3,4	25	2,790	6.6					
Malawi	10,163,000	4,2	12	210	- 0.7					
South Africa 38,778,000		2,4	50	2,670	- 1.3					
Uganda	19,261,000	3,3	12	170	2.3					

Table 1. Basic indicators

Sources:

- * UNESCO World Report on Education, 1995.
- ** World Development Report 1996, Oxford University Press, 1996.

Regarding populations the variation is substantial, ranging from approximately 1.4 million in Botswana (although this country is not small in surface area) to some 38.8 million in South Africa. Malawi with 10.2 million and Uganda with almost double, 19.3 million people, ranging between the extremes.

With half of its population living in urban areas, a Gross National Product (GNP) per capita of US\$ 2,670 and a relatively moderate pace of population growth, South Africa presents certain features which are characteristic of economically developed middle-income countries. Botswana has a similar level of income per capita but its urban population represents only 25 per cent of the country's total population, which has been growing at a rather faster rate over the past decade.

In Uganda and Malawi on the other hand, the level of income per capita is among the lowest in the world. The economies of these two countries experienced stagnation — in the case of Uganda even recession (mainly due to war and political instability) in the 1980s, their populations have been growing at a faster rate and their adult illiteracy rates (see *Table 2*) are still significantly higher than those of Botswana and South Africa. Both Uganda and Malawi continue to be very predominantly rural, with only around 12 per cent of the population living in urban areas.

The specific conditions and challenges the four countries have to face, with regard to the provision and utilization of teachers in the near future, are influenced by the above-mentioned economic and demographic factors. They also depend on the level of educational development already attained, projected enrolment trends and other variables affecting educational provision.

A few educational indicators are presented in *Table 2*. As can be concluded from the gross enrolment rates, Botswana and South Africa are near attaining universal primary education for boys and girls, whereas Malawi

and Uganda still have some way to go to reach this target. However, in all four countries primary enrolment has recorded substantial increases since the beginning of the 1980s. In Malawi and Uganda this has been due largely to the substantial growth of girls enrolment in primary schools. Based on these statistics the two countries would have hopes of approaching the target of Universal Primary Education within the next 10 years if the present pace of enrolment is maintained: this, however, would have challenging implications. Given the projected high growth of the primary population, on one hand, and the particularly serious financial constraints that they are facing, on the other — Uganda and Malawi will have to address the challenge of providing a sufficient number of trained primary teachers while containing, at the same time, the investment in the teaching force.

The quantitative provision of primary teachers appears to be less problematic in South Africa and Botswana. However, as the survival rates of the respective primary cohorts until Grade 5 (indicated in *Table 2*) suggest, all four countries have to cope with problems of internal efficiency and quality at primary level and need to be concerned about the qualitative aspects of the utilization and deployment of their primary teachers which will include a balanced distribution of well qualified and experienced teachers among different geographical areas and schools. In certain contexts, particularly that of the present post-Apartheid era in South Africa and the introduction of Universal Primary Education in Malawi in October 1994, the response to this challenge will be of major importance not only for the functioning of the education system, but also for the overall social and political stability of the country.

Table 2. Educational indicators

Country	Estimated illiteracy rate of adults (1995)					Duration of primary cycle (number of years)	% of pupils in private primary schools	Public education expenditure/total government expenditure*	% of primary cohort attaining Grade 5	
	Male	Female	Ma	ale	Fen	nale				
			1980	1992	1980	1992		1992	1992	
Botswana	19.5	40.1	83	113	100	120	7	4	18.7	84
Malawi	28.1	58.2	72	74	48	62	8	10	10.3*	46
South										
Africa	18.1	18.3	w.i.	112	w.i.	111	7	1	22.1	71
Uganda	26.3	49.8	60	78	44	63	7	w.i.	15.0	55

Source: UNESCO World Report on Education, 1995.

* Figures for 1990, source: Donors to African education; a statistical profile of education in sub-Saharan Africa in the 1980s, UNESCO/IIEP, 1994.

w.i.: without indication.

Section II

Current conditions, policies and challenges of primary teacher utilization, deployment and management in the four countries

1. Present profiles of primary teaching staff

In all four countries primary teachers are on average relatively young: a majority is below the age of 35 and one third or more of all primary teachers have less than five years of professional experience. The number and proportion of young and inexperienced teachers is particularly high in Malawi, where the recent introduction (1994) of free primary education has resulted in massive population increases in schools, around 70 per cent, and a concomitant need for the recruitment of new teachers. This raises the question of how to make best use of the newly recruited teaching corps. What would be the appropriate 'mix' of experienced and inexperienced staff for primary schools? And how to attain a well-balanced distribution of the inexperienced teacher across the different geographical zones and primary schools of the country? Although this issue is most pressing in Malawi, the general principles apply equally to the other countries.

Another common feature which characterizes — although to varying degrees — the primary teaching corps in the four countries is the significant proportion of unqualified or underqualified staff among primary teachers. In Uganda and Malawi about 40 per cent of all primary teachers are unqualified:

even the formally 'qualified' teachers are generally considered to have received professional training of rather poor quality. In South Africa the share of primary teachers who do not have the officially required M+3 qualification (i.e. standard 10 certificate and at least three years of professional training) is also about 40 per cent. In Botswana in 1994, 'only' about a quarter of the teaching staff at primary level was 'unqualified': this group included a significant number of young graduates who were offered places as 'teachers' during the period of their National Service. A major common challenge therefore for the four countries is to deploy the un- and under-qualified teachers in the most efficient way possible across the different areas and different schools of the country, taking account particularly of the availability of experienced and qualified teachers and of other staff able to provide the teachers with advice, support and help.

A second challenge is to make these un- and/or under-qualified teachers as effective as possible in their teaching practice, by providing them with adequate training and by creating favourable conditions, through sensitive and appropriate posting and follow-up support, for the actual utilization of the newly acquired competencies in the job.

Many of the unqualified or underqualified primary teachers are temporary, i.e. they are employed on the basis of a generally renewable one-year contract and therefore do not benefit from the conditions of employment of permanent teachers or civil servants (e.g. housing allowances, incremental salary increase according to length of service, maternity leave, etc.). In the short term, the employment of temporary teachers is a possible way of addressing teacher shortages, in certain geographical areas or certain disciplines, in a flexible and cost-saving manner; however, in the long run, it may prove too difficult to manage the coexistence of a variety of 'teachers' whose conditions of service, salary levels, status, privileges etc. differ, even though they may be expected to do the same job.

Current conditions, policies and challenges of primary teacher utilization, deployment and management in the four countries

Besides a certain number of similarities the comparison of primary teaching staff of Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda also show some contrasting features. In particular the percentage of females among primary teaching staff differs to a large extent from one country to another. Among the primary teachers of Uganda and Malawi only about one third are women, whereas women form three quarters of the primary teachers in Botswana and 60 per cent in South Africa. Educational decision-makers and managers need to consider, on the one hand, that the provision of female teachers can have a positive role-model impact on the participation and retention of girls in primary education, especially in the more traditional rural communities; therefore it may be desirable to try to create an even distribution of women teachers among the different areas and different schools of the country. On the other hand, some of the country monographs on which this synthesis report is based, suggest (although relevant reliable data on this point are not available) that absenteeism tends to be higher among female than among male teachers, the main explanatory factors mentioned being pregnancy and child-care related and other family duties that women fulfil in society: the conclusion for educational managers is of course not to curb the share of women teachers, but rather to create appropriate conditions for their optimal use.

Last, but not least, one should not overlook the fact that the size of the primary teaching staff varies to a rather large extent from one country to another — from 200,000 teachers in South Africa to 12,000 teachers in Botswana (in 1994). One may assume that the specific terms and conditions (e.g. the devolution of certain responsibilities to the district or school levels) of efficient staff utilization, deployment and management differ, at least to a certain extent, according to the size of the staff to be administered; of course they are also a function of the existing system of communication and transport among the different schools and administrative units of the country. We shall return to this issue later in *sections IV and V*.

2. Norms and practices of teacher utilization

In all four countries considered here, the governments have fixed official pupil/teacher ratio (PTR) norms and, in some cases, staffing formulae which are designed to guide the staffing of primary schools.

The officially prescribed pupil/teacher ratio is relatively high in the four countries considered here, with 1:40 in Uganda and South Africa, 1:45 in Botswana (although the government aims to reduce it to 1:40 in the medium term) and 1:60 in Malawi. However, these figures conceal large disparities among the actual PTR in different districts and within districts among schools (see *Table 3*). To a certain extent the norms set by the respective governments take actual pupil enrolment and teacher provision into account as well, of course, as the realities of budgets; thus the official norm could hardly be lower in Malawi, given the fact that in practice it is not uncommon for a primary teacher to have in the class more than 150 pupils. One may be surprised to note that neither Malawi nor Botswana are using the double shift system (which exists in certain schools in South Africa and in Uganda), i.e. one teacher teaching two classes/streams, one in the morning, the other in the afternoon — as a mode of reducing, where it is necessary, the class size without increasing the teaching force. However, the successful use of the 'double shift' system presupposes: (i) adequate (financial and other) incentives through which teachers can be motivated to accept this mode of teaching, and (ii) the establishment of appropriate conditions (timetabling etc.) under which the double shift system can be effective for all pupils concerned.

The workload of teachers constitutes another significant indicator for the utilization of the teaching staff. The figures reported on Malawi and South Africa (see *Table 3*) indicate that there are substantial variations in the official workload of primary teachers between the two countries mentioned. At the same time there may be variations in teachers' workload within a country. In

Country	Teacher/pupil T/P** ratios	Variation of actual ratio (official norm)	No. of contact hours/week	Multi-grade teaching	Double shift * teaching
Botswana	1 : 45	1 : 19 — 1 : 48 (variation between districts)	w.i.	No	No
Malawi	1:60 up to 1:150		15h (std 1+2) -27h (std 5-8)	No	No
South Africa	1:40	1:19 — 1:56 (depending on the province and racial group to which the school belongs)	30 teaching hourss + 10 hours extra mural activitie (minimum)	No	Yes (in certain schools)
Uganda	1 : 40	1 : 17 — 1 : 39 according to district; very high in certain schools	w.i.	w.i.	Yes

Table 3. Some indicators of primary teacher utilization

* = Meaning that the same teacher teaches two classes of pupils, one in the morning, one in the afternoon.

** = In government and grant-aided schools.

w.i.= without indication

19

Current conditions, policies and challenges of primary teacher utilization, deployment and management in the four countries the case of Malawi, the number of contact hours for Standard 5 to 8 teachers is much higher than for Standard 1 and 2 teachers, for example, although teacher remuneration is the same in both cases. Without a much more detailed study on the actual workload and conditions of teachers in the countries considered, international comparisons could lead to erroneous conclusions. Surprisingly, all four countries included in the IIEP survey have neglected to monitor the amount of class contact and global workload that teachers actually have.

Where teacher salaries are so low that primary teachers are obliged to have a 'second job' to make ends meet for them and their family (in Uganda for example the teachers earn only slightly more than US\$ 400 per year which is ten times less than someone with the same level of formal qualification who works in the private sector) it seems difficult or pointless to increase teachers' official workload without substantially raising their level of remuneration. Furthermore, some of the monographs mention the continuing problem of long and frequent delays in the payment of salaries, which tends to reinforce absenteeism and low morale and lack of commitment of teachers. In Malawi, for example, teachers who went on transfer reported that it took as long as three months before their pay was sent to their new station. Botswana, on the other hand, seems to have been successful in addressing the issue of regular payment through the spread of banking services and the institution of special 'pay days' on which teachers are not on duty and can go to collect their pay from their bank account, if necessary. On the other hand, it seems reasonable to expect that teachers satisfactorily fulfil a full-time job if they are paid decent salaries which are comparable to those of other professional categories with similar levels of qualifications. In South Africa, for example, primary teachers receive entry-level salaries of between US\$ 7,000 and 13,000 per year, according to their level of qualification and post. This compares favourably with an executive secretary and is half that of an electrical engineer in the private sector.

Current conditions, policies and challenges of primary teacher utilization, deployment and management in the four countries

In any case, it seems to be important to review and, if necessary, further differentiate and refine the official norms and standards that are guiding the utilization of teachers (i.e. staffing of primary schools, teacher workload, teaching mode etc.) taking into account the actual constraints and conditions that schools and teachers are facing. Optimal teacher utilization, furthermore, requires that the teaching force be deployed in an equitable and appropriate manner among the different areas and schools of the country; and that the posts — especially those with special responsibilities — be filled with appropriate staff; these two issues will be looked at more closely in the following subsections.

3. Imbalances in the deployment of primary teachers

Imbalances in the geographical distribution of qualified teachers can be observed in Malawi, Uganda and also, although to a lesser extent, in Botswana. In Malawi the number of untrained primary teachers is particularly high in the Southern Region, some 47 per cent of the total primary teaching staff in this region being unqualified. In Uganda one can observe similar proportions of unqualified teachers in a few districts; in several other districts some 25 per cent of the primary teaching force is not qualified. In both of these countries the capital and a few other urbanized areas suffer least from a shortage of qualified teachers. As the respective country monographs suggest, thorough investigations could even reveal teacher surpluses in certain urban schools. The latter also tend to be characterized by high shares of female teachers.

In Botswana only one district (Kgalagadi) records 40 per cent of unqualified primary teachers, and two others percentage figures close to 30 per cent (in 1993). South Africa constitutes a special case in that the legacy of the former Apartheid system has been a particularly high proportion of 'unqualified' staff — according to the now country-wide adopted standards of qualification — among African and coloured primary teachers; these imbalances have been considerably reduced over recent years, however.

All four countries record rather large geographical and other types of disparities in the utilization of primary teachers. The number of pupils per teacher and per class is generally high in the urban areas, in certain districts and — within the areas or districts considered — in certain schools. In the sparsely populated rural or remote areas, on the other hand, the pupil/teacher ratios can be very low; for several districts in Uganda and Botswana, for example, the average pupil/teacher ratio is below or around 20. However, in none of the countries does multi-grade teaching — which could constitute a strategy for rationalizing the use of the teaching force available in such areas — appear to be a common practice.

Because of their relatively difficult living and working conditions certain remote areas have problems in attracting qualified and experienced teachers; in certain countries (Botswana e.g.) some districts suffer from a particularly high rate of teacher turnover due to frequent requests for transfer out of these areas. Teacher turnover requires consequent staff redeployment. Redeployment is also becoming a particularly burning issue in South Africa, where surpluses exist in particular among white teachers while there are, at the same time, still shortages of fully qualified black and coloured African teachers. In this country there may be a risk of rather high teacher attrition — due to movements towards the public or private non-teaching sector over the next few years to come (less than during the times of economic boom in the past, though). In the three other countries, teacher attrition (for other reasons than health or death) has been declining or has stabilized since alternative employment opportunities for trained teachers have tended to become scarcer. It is alarming, however, to note that in Malawi and Uganda health problems and death (which are partly attributed to HIV diseases) have become the main reasons for teacher attrition.

Current conditions, policies and challenges of primary teacher utilization, deployment and management in the four countries

4. Problems of mismatch between posts and holders

The majority of the countries studied seem to be facing rather serious problems of mismatch between the requirements of promotional posts, especially those of the post of a principal/school head, on the one hand, and the profile of the holders of such posts, on the other hand. In most cases such posts are filled with applicants satisfying certain requirements in terms of formal qualification levels and years of experience in the teaching service; however, specific training for the new responsibilities is often not provided, or offered only after the person has been nominated for and is occupying the new post.

Unfortunately, precise and detailed information on the various quantitative and qualitative aspects of this issue are missing in the country monographs summarized here. Lack of data and qualitative information, not only on this point but also on many other critical questions regarding teachers, actually appears to be one of the major causes of inefficiencies in the management of teacher deployment and utilization in the countries studied. The following section will be dealing with this central issue.

Section III Information systems for teacher management

The development of comprehensive and efficient information systems which would enhance management in the education sector remains a current concern in the four countries. It is agreed that without reliable, accurate and up-to-date information it is impossible to plan coherently and systematically for the development of the education service and, in particular, to manage efficiently and effectively the utilization and deployment of teachers.

1. Existing information base

In general the administrations in the four countries - Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda — concerned with the utilization and deployment of primary teachers at central, regional and district levels have only a rather restricted set of relevant information at their disposal. The data which are commonly collected, processed and accessible at a nationwide (or sometimes at regional/provincial/district) level, relate to the number, age, sex and level of qualification of permanent teaching staff. Some information on staff utilization, namely the application of pupil/teacher ratios, and on the geographical balance of teacher allocation and deployment is generally available. However, there are many other aspects of teacher utilization and deployment on which the relevant data are missing, piecemeal or unreliable such as teacher attrition, absenteeism, attendance at in-service courses, actual working and living conditions of teachers and the actual utilization and deployment of teachers within the different districts and schools. There is also very little systematic information on so-called 'temporary teachers' (hired on the basis of short-term - but renewable - contracts), the numbers of whom are presently expanding rapidly in many countries of sub-Saharan Africa.

Even with these gaps in their information systems the four countries have made significant use of computerized information systems to ensure that their personnel records on teachers are more accurate and that the teachers are paid more regularly. For example, in South Africa, they use an electronic Personnel and Salary System (PerSal) which has greatly enhanced the administration of personnel, financial and staff matters in the education sector. However, as the country moves to a new post-Apartheid structure for the delivery of education services, the system will require review and development to ensure that it can function as a 'unified' database which will provide coherence of information across different administrative levels and various bodies which have formerly been governing separately the different segments of the school system.

In Uganda, the implementation of a systematic review of teaching personnel using a computerized management information system allowed the government to identify and remove some 25,000 'ghost' teachers, which was about a quarter of the total teaching force. Thanks to careful computerization and data-collection processes based on accountability, control and reward mechanisms across all administrative levels, the information system set up in Botswana has also allowed educational decision-makers to be confident that the number of teachers they employ and pay is accurate. The country is concurrently reviewing the possibilities of decentralizing certain personnel functions to a regional and district level. This will inevitably include a review of the management data required and of information systems to be developed at these levels. The country also investigates possible ways in which its management information systems can be more comprehensive and efficient for educational policy-making and management at all levels.

However, the reality is that, although some progress has been made, all four countries are experiencing (different degrees) major difficulties in setting up and maintaining systems which will provide the relevant information required for different administrative levels, different personnel and different functions involved in staff planning and management.

2. Major weaknesses and their possible causes

A certain number of weaknesses regarding information for teacher management which are commonly reported relate to the existing databases for educational management and policy-making in general. Among them one may note in particular the following:

- information that can be obtained from the statistics section is usually not very up to date as it is collected annually and processed and disseminated with a delay of one year and more;
- it also seems difficult for educational decision-makers to obtain a comprehensive picture of a specific educational management or policy issue since the existing data are often incomplete and rarely available for a series of years;
- educational research which could complement the statistical and administrative information through other means is underdeveloped in general.

In brief: none of the countries studied within the IIEP project to date seem to have succeeded in establishing a comprehensive and effective Educational Management Information System which would help managers operating at national or intermediate levels in evaluating policy options and in monitoring the education sector on a regular basis; this has proved to be a serious handicap in the planning and administering of the education sector and its human resources.

Beyond these difficulties concerning educational management information in general, the country monographs point to certain specific shortcomings regarding existing databases for teacher management:

- the data on teachers kept in individual records are often inaccurate and out-dated;
- there is a lack of precise and reliable data on teacher demand and nonsatisfied teacher requirements which brings the forecasting of teacher supply and planning of teacher allocation in certain cases close to a 'trial and error' exercise;
- comprehensive information on teacher turnover and transfer is not systematically collected and made available to those in charge of staff planning and management;
- where there is relevant information, its reliability and accessibility are often problematic; especially, information on schools and their staff utilization is not available in a comprehensive and reliable format in Ministry Headquarters;
- especially the provincial or district offices to which many primary teacher management tasks are more and more devolved suffer from the absence of an adequate database for carrying out these tasks.

These difficulties may — at least partly — be at the origin of the sporadic use that is reported to be actually made of the existing database for decision-making on assignments, in-service training, teacher transfer and promotions.

Various factors are particularly frequently put forward to explain the mentioned weaknesses of existing teacher management systems:

• Shortcomings in the coherence and comprehensiveness of the data available in different administrations and at different levels are mainly attributed to a lack of co-ordination among all those involved in the

management of teachers: the collection of data which are relevant for their efficient utilization and management is generally not synchronized and co-ordinated among the different ministries and services interested and the methods and formats used for data collection are not uniform.

- The information on teachers available at central (or provincial/regional) level is incomplete because not all districts and schools send in the requested data.
- In some cases teachers have been falsifying the data. Verifications turn out to be very difficult, especially where cross-checking of data is impeded by the lack of co-operation and communication between the different administrative units concerned.
- In some of the countries the administrative bodies involved do not have computers and other modern technical facilities which could help in processing data for teacher management more rapidly and bring them in a more adequate and reliable format. Provincial/regional and district offices suffer particularly from shortages of technical and human resources which are required for the efficient processing and use of information.
- Where most of the relevant data on teachers are kept in paper files which are easily misplaced or go missing, there may even be a need to re-organize the teacher record system and the registry.

3. A possible way ahead

This brief summary of observations drawn from the monographs and from the discussion at the workshop points to the need for a much more coordinated strategy — across all administrative departments and levels concerned — for the development and use of management information systems in the countries. It appears that without it the management, utilization and deployment of teachers will remain problematic.

Any new Management Information System (MIS) would also have to take into account the trend towards decentralization and decongestion of powers and the impact of the implementation of free Universal Primary Education for All.

The development and implementation of such a strategy will require significant funding but a cost benefit analysis would almost certainly prove the case for an immediate investment of time and money as this lack of reliable data goes to the heart of ineffective and inefficient utilization and deployment of teachers.

Section IV Management and administrative structures devolution and decentralization

There are a number of similarities in the way in which the management and administration of education in the four countries is structured.

In general, the central Ministry of Education (MOE) has retained the responsibility for planning and policy-making. Between the Ministry and schools there are, depending on the country, two or three intermediate levels — provincial, regional and district. These levels have, in the main, a responsibility for implementing educational policy and fulfilling a great number of tasks relating to the management and administration of primary teachers. At a more local level, there are sometimes community councils and school boards that have an important role to play in the administration of primary teachers to fulfil in the utilization and deployment of the teachers.

Additionally, some countries have set up (Uganda) or are setting up (Malawi) Teaching (Education) Service Commissions which operate at a central and decentralized level. These Commissions have responsibility for recruitment, appointment, training and, in some instances, the promotion of primary teachers and work co-operatively with the Ministry of Education.

The following grids give a much more detailed picture for each country of the distribution of tasks and activities associated with teacher utilization and deployment, among the different levels — central, intermediate and local — in the four countries.

Botswana

Grid 1. Distribution of tasks/activities related to staff management and deployment

Mark * which body or level is involved in the respective tasks in your country.

		Cei	ntral	Interm	nediate	Local		
	Tasks/activities	Ministry	Teaching service management	Regional office	District office	School cluster/ local	School	
•	Setting staffing standards	*						
•	Estimation of school rolls including enrolments, reports, drop-out etc.			*	*	*	*	
•	Estimation of projected staffing entitlement of schools		*					
•	Estimation of retirements, resignations		*	*	*	*		
•	Conducting promotion of staff		*					
•	Estimation of 'vacancies' in schools					*	*	
•	Estimation of 'surplus' staff in schools					*	*	
•	Arrangements for transfer of staff: - voluntarily, - compulsorily		*					
•	Preparation of list of remaining 'vacancies'			*		*		
•	Finalization of list of applicants for remaining 'vacancies'		*					
•	Arrangements for postings		*		*			
•	Arrangements for assignment							
•	Assessment of teacher's salary		*					
•	Payment of salary		*					

31

Malawi

Grid 1. Distribution of tasks/activities related to staff management and deployment

Mark * which body or level is involved in the respective tasks in your country.

		Cer	ntral	Interm	ediate	Local	
	Tasks/activities	Ministry	Teaching service management	Regional office	District office	School cluster/ local	School
•	Setting staffing standards	*					
•	Estimation of school rolls including enrolments, reports, drop-out etc.				*		*
•	Estimation of projected staffing entitlement of schools				*		
•	Estimation of retirements, resignations				*		
•	Conducting promotion of staff		*	*	*		
•	Estimation of 'vacancies' in schools				*		*
•	Estimation of 'surplus' staff in schools				*		*
•	Arrangements for transfer of staff: - voluntarily, - compulsorily			*	*		
•	Preparation of list of remaining 'vacancies'				*		
•	Finalization of list of applicants for remaining 'vacancies'	*					
•	Arrangements for postings	*		*	*		
•	Arrangements for assignment				*		
•	Assessment of teacher's salary	*		*			
•	Payment of salary			*	*		

South Africa

Grid 1. Distribution of tasks/activities related to staff management and deployment

Mark * which body or level is involved in the respective tasks in your country.

			Central		Interm	nediate		Local	
	Tasks/activities	National Ministry	Educ. Labour Relations council	Province	Regional office	District office	School cluster/ local	School	Teacher Orgs
•	Setting staffing standards	*	*	*					*
•	Estimation of school rolls including enrolments, reports, drop-out etc.					*		*	
•	Estimation of projected staffing entitlement of schools			*					
•	Estimation of retirements, resignations			*					
•	Conducting promotion of staff					*		*	*
•	Estimation of 'vacancies' in schools			*		*		*	
•	Estimation of 'surplus' staff in schools			*		*		*	
•	Arrangements for transfer of staff: - voluntarily, - compulsorily	*		*				*	
•	Preparation of list of remaining 'vacancies'			*					
•	Finalization of list of applicants for remaining 'vacancies'			*					
•	Arrangements for postings			*					
•	Arrangements for assignment					*			
•	Assessment of teacher's salary		*	*				*	
•	Payment of salary			*				*	

33

Uganda

Grid 1. Distribution of tasks/activities related to staff management and deployment

Mark * which body or level is involved in the respective tasks in your country.

		Cer	ntral	Interm	nediate	Local		
	Tasks/activities	Ministry	Education Service Commission	Regional office	District office	School cluster/ local	School	
•	Setting staffing standards	*	*		*		*	
•	Estimation of school rolls including enrolments, reports, drop-out etc.	*			*		*	
•	Estimation of projected staffing entitlement of schools	*			*		*	
•	Estimation of retirements, resignations	*	*		*		*	
•	Conducting promotion of staff	*	*		*		*	
•	Estimation of 'vacancies' in schools	*	*		*		*	
•	Estimation of 'surplus' staff in schools	*			*		*	
•	Arrangements for transfer of staff: - voluntarily, - compulsorily	* *			*		* *	
•	Preparation of list of remaining 'vacancies'	*			*		*	
•	Finalization of list of applicants for remaining 'vacancies'	*			*		*	
•	Arrangements for postings	*			*		*	
•	Arrangements for assignment	*			*		*	
•	Assessment of teacher's salary	*	*		*		*	
•	Payment of salary	*	*		*		*	

As can be seen from a comparison of the grids, the terminology and structure varies from country to country but in broad terms the distribution of activities is similar and the trend towards decentralization is noticeable. However, the detailed functioning at these levels and their impact on teacher provision and service delivery has not been the subject of in-depth research or organizational audits and the implementation of decentralization in the field of teacher management is still regarded as slow (in some countries even cosmetic). There is still, irrespective of the rhetoric and good intentions, an uphill battle to be fought to overcome the inbuilt inertia of centralization.

This conclusion is reinforced by critical comments in the monographs about the 'state of play' of decentralization. Some examples of the weaknesses perceived are as follows:

- at school level head teachers/principals tend to lack the leadership and training needed to operate as efficient managers;
- for almost all administrative departments and levels involved in teacher management one notes a lack of clear-cut roles, which tends to generate conflicts, vacuums of power and overlap and duplication of effort;
- some district officers do not provide the level and type of professional and administrative support teachers and principals expect of them, even though there are mitigating circumstances, for example, lack of appropriate training and resources, shortage of support staff, etc.;
- procedures on which major decisions on teacher deployment and other related staff management matters are based tend to leave margins for manoeuvre and sometimes uncontrolled intervention from the 'centre' or from local pressure groups.

In all four countries, however, there continues to be a declared policy in favour of decentralization of administrative control and devolution of power to a more local level. The issue is now much more about putting the strategy into practice in a way in which the system will become more democratic, accountable and responsive to local needs.

Section V

The rules, procedures and practices of primary teacher utilization and deployment

1. Teacher supply

In general terms the planning of teacher supply is done centrally, normally by the planning department of the Ministry of Education. The estimates of teacher supply and demand should be informed by data supplied directly from schools, aggregated at district and regional levels, before being incorporated with the planning forecast. In practice, however, the collection and processing of the data on schools and teachers are found to be unsatisfactory in many instances, as mentioned earlier. Furthermore, little use seems to be made of this data when the projections of future teacher demand are carried out.

Among the countries considered here, Malawi has recently experienced spectacular growth in the number of teachers employed in primary schools; the country has also been running short-term training schemes for a large number of untrained teachers. Not only in the case of Malawi, but also in some of the other countries of the region, impressive and quick expansion of the primary education service and its teaching staff, as well as the provision of in-service training for untrained teachers, have been achieved to a large extent due to efficient co-operation between the government, external aid agencies, NGOs and other partners.

However, in general there seem to be considerable shortcomings in the organization and functioning of the co-ordination and co-operation between

different administrations and organizations involved in planning teacher supply and training (i.e. pre- and in-service training) and subsequent deployment of teachers; this area would merit some detailed analysis in the four countries.

Another response to rapidly rising teacher demand has been the hiring of temporary teachers; evaluation studies on the medium-term impact of this strategy on the functioning and outcome (in terms of pupil achievement, staff retention, etc.) of the primary education service, as well as on the satisfaction of the total teaching staff employed, would also be of interest but are presently still lacking.

More generally, it would be important to conduct more systematic investigations on efficient strategies of teacher provision in those contexts where demand continues to exceed the possible supply. Rationalization measures, such as redeployment of teachers overstaffing administrative offices or certain urban schools to those schools where they are needed, have been tried out over recent years. Elements on their effects on the different quantitative and qualitative aspects of primary teacher provision are available in certain cases and should be evaluated in a more systematic way.

2. Staffing norms/standards

As mentioned earlier in this paper, primary staffing standards are fixed centrally but vary in practice within countries — with the most marked variations being between rural and urban areas.

The detailed methods of calculating the staffing entitlement for individual schools are often not known by all those concerned and it is unclear which pupils are included in the roll that generates staffing entitlement. It is neither very clear whether the head teacher is included or excluded from the straight application of the ratio. In all countries there appears to be no recognition or

The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

positive discrimination given to areas of special need, e.g. in the form of lowering of pupil/teacher ratios.

Staffing formulae constitute yet another instance of policies which have been developed centrally, appear fair and reasonable but which are not or cannot be implemented locally in many cases.

3. Recruitment, assignment and posting

Recruitment is usually done centrally and then allocations made to regions, districts and schools. The assignment and posting to school is generally done only after consultation with local education authorities, school proprietors and/or school heads.

The assignment and posting decisions should take into account:

- the disparities in the system geographical;
- qualifications of teachers;
- experience of teachers;
- sex of teachers;

and should attempt to strengthen the staffing of schools by improving the pupil/ teacher ratios and/or increasing the number of qualified teachers in the school.

Efficient posting and transfers should aim at replacing staff lost through either death, illness or promotion and providing an equitable balance of teachers by grade/age/experience/sex. It can also contribute:

- to improve academic performance of a particularly weak school;
- to restore discipline in schools.

The reported rules and regulations covering assignments and posting are rather detailed. Most of them appear fair and reasonable. However, as mentioned earlier, there are considerable variations in the quantitative and qualitative provision of teachers from region to region, district to district and school to school. It proves to be difficult, for example, to make newly trained teachers accept assignments in certain remote areas (or certain schools) and even more difficult to retain qualified and experienced staff in the latter.

The problem has been tackled, however, in the country studied though the application of special measures, e.g. hardship allowances for service in remote areas and obligation of newly trained teachers and/or those asking for promotion to serve for a certain number of years in areas or schools where vacancies are difficult to fill.

4. Transfer arrangements

In all countries there are arrangements for the transfer of teachers. These transfers are normally voluntary and are requested by teachers either because of personal or family circumstances or perhaps to gain wider teaching experience. A significant number of transfers in Botswana, Malawi and Uganda are granted to allow wives to follow their spouses. These transfers, while helpful to the teachers generally, do little to correct the imbalance or disparity between schools or districts or regions.

In most countries, the imposed or compulsory transfer appears to be used only occasionally to help balance the number of teachers both qualitatively and quantitatively and hence the overall effect is that there are still very significant imbalances in staffing between similar sized schools. In Botswana, however, compulsory transfer is not only legal but also actually implemented with the help of certain compensatory measures, e.g. transportation and other special allowances. Mandatory transfers are more difficult to achieve where the necessary funds to provide incentives to transfer, e.g. accelerated promotion, disturbance allowances, free transport, decent accommodation etc., are lacking. The denominations of schools may also complicate teacher transfer in certain cases. Beyond these factors, however, there seems to be a lack of conviction among administrators that one can get to grips with this issue.

Therefore, even although there are administrative arrangements for transfers within districts, between districts and even between regions, their appropriateness and effective implementation remain a crucial issue to resolve if significant headway is to be made in correcting imbalances and disparities in staffing.

5. Promotion to senior posts

40

There have been improvements in the arrangements for the promotion of staff in primary schools. Most countries advertise the posts and give some indication of the job functions and in broad terms a person specification.

Furthermore, the process is increasingly being handled locally. In South Africa and Botswana, it is now the norm for applicants to be short-listed and then interviewed by a panel comprising the regional/district officers, local education councils and/or school heads and proprietors, although representatives of the headquarters still have a say in this matter.

Even with these improvements there is nevertheless still a feeling among staff that the system is biased and unfair. Another problem is the access of women to head teacher and other promotional posts. Some progress, however, has been made in these areas. In South Africa the transparency of promotion decisions has been enhanced since the latter are, henceforth, taken with the participation of the school board and representatives of the teacher unions. There are also attempts to address the under-representation of women in senior posts. Uganda, for example, applies a special quota for women in head-teacher posts.

More generally, there remains wide criticism that important factors, e.g. inspection and annual reports, tend to be omitted from the consideration of the promotion and that other factors such as length of service are given undue weight. Last but not least — although, for example, Botswana and Malawi have made efforts to create new promotional posts — there is a general concern that the flat hierarchy of posts characterizing the teaching profession leaves too few promotion opportunities, especially in the primary education sector.

6. The annual staffing process

Some of the crucial practical — routine management — issues concerning the utilization and deployment of primary teachers in a given country can be identified more clearly by considering the *annual staffing process*. The process of planning and implementing measures associated with teaching staff utilization and deployment is generally managed on a recurring annual cycle.

The mentioned workshop held in South Africa, therefore included an exercise (the *annual staffing exercise*) aimed at analyzing the annual process of staffing primary schools in the four participating countries, and their policies and practices of teacher utilization and deployment — staffing norms/ standards; postings; transfers; promotions/retirals etc. This exercise was considered to be very useful for educational planners and managers involved in teacher deployment and management and worth while of being further developed as a tool for improving the preparation, monitoring and implementation of an annual staffing plan.

Section VI Some general conclusions

The analysis of the monographs and discussion at the workshop led to the identification of:

- (i) some of the main problems of teacher utilization and deployment and their possible responses;
- (ii) three major challenges facing all four countries, namely:
 - setting up efficient management information systems,
 - decentralizing certain activities/tasks associated with teacher utilization and deployment,
 - implementation of policies on teacher utilization and deployment, and possible avenues for improvement;
- (iii) a set of variables which form the wider context into which any attempt to manage teacher utilization and deployment must fit.

The main results of the presentations and discussions on these points are summarized in *Figure 1* below.

In conclusion, although the monographs and the presentations and discussion at the workshop demonstrate the efforts which have been made in the countries, there are still major challenges relating to the efficient management of teacher utilization and deployment. One major open problem, which is widely acknowledged, concerns the *general lack of empirical knowledge and effective management information systems*. This is such a fundamental issue that if it remains unresolved it is difficult to see how

progress can be made towards more efficient and effective teacher utilization and deployment.

It will also have a serious detrimental effect on attempts to decentralize systems. There is therefore an immediate need to review the existing arrangements for the identification, collection, processing and analysis of data as they affect teachers' personnel issues. Such a system should be based on consultation, co-operation and co-ordination and should aim to provide reliable, accurate and up-to-date information on teachers.

A second major concern relates to the clear intention in the countries to move towards a more *decentralized model* of delivering educational services and managing teachers in particular. However, the monographs imply that *the pace of change is slow and the reality seems to be that the impact is often cosmetic and rather superficial*. The reasons for this apparent inertia and lack of progress are many and varied. One possible explanation appears to be that those at the centre are, in some cases, unhappy about the effects of decentralization on their own functions and, in consequence do little to facilitate the change. Alternatively, there are some indications that staff in the field, who have been brought up in a hierarchical system, still find the organizational and cultural change difficult to accept and hence still tend to assume that the Ministry is the focus of all activity and decisions, even those that are routine.

In many instances, administrators operating at the school and intermediate levels are, furthermore, exposed to the pressure of influential personalities of the local communities and it is not exceptional to find their decisions being 'biased' by local favouritism. This brings us to the more general question of how to set up an adequate system of 'checks and balances' between the central, intermediate and school/local levels that ensures, country-wide, equity, justice and efficiency in the deployment and utilization of primary teachers. The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

Some of the other drawbacks of decentralization are more tangible, for example, the lack of funding, human resources and efficient infrastructures at the more local level. At all levels there seem to be problems of adequate training and preparation of management staff and of insufficient clarity in the job descriptions and functions of the various staff involved.

However, steady improvements have been made in the routine management and administration of teachers. Policies have been developed on many aspects of teacher utilization and deployment, for example postings, transfers, promotion, staffing standards. These policies are aimed at improving the management of teachers and have often been designed in consultation and partnership with other stakeholders. The main difficulty seems to arise in relation to the implementation of such polices. The transfer of teachers is a good example. As indicated earlier, most countries have a clear policy on the reasons for transferring teachers and the circumstances under which transfers should take place. Nevertheless, the practical reality is that all countries still have an alarming imbalance of staffing between schools and little attempt seems to be made to counteract this by effecting compulsory or imposed transfers or by establishing better systems of monitoring and regulation and appropriate incentive measures. Although there is an undeniable lack of reliable data which tends to impede efficient teacher management, the crux of this and other problems may be more about how local management confronts difficult decisions and how different elements of the staffing of schools — planning and implementation of staffing standards, transfers, promotions, postings etc. — are co-ordinated and managed jointly at central, intermediate and school/local levels.

Figure 1. Utilization, deployment and management of primary teachers

Issues and responses

(i) MAIN PROBLEMS

POSSIBLE RESPONSES

- 1. Deployment
- Geographical imbalances
- Imbalances among schools
- Delays
- Posts left vacant despite allocation decisions

2. TEACHER UTILIZATION

- Staffing norms are insufficiently context-related
- Insufficient implementation of staffing norms at school level
- Lack of teacher commitment and absenteeism
- High turnover (frequent transfers etc.)

- Hardship allowances 'right sizing' committees
- Special allowances for transfer/ accelerated promotion
- Compulsory posting
- Hiring of temporary teachers
- Better geographical distribution of teacher training institutions
- Improved information flow on vacancies
- Enhanced consultation with teachers
- Improving the annual staffing procedure
- Refining staff establishment formula
- Improving information on actual teacher utilization
- Enhancing the competence and accountability of school heads
- Improving teachers' conditions of service
- Acceleration of the payment of teachers' salaries; special days for teachers' pay
- Enhancing the professionalism and involvement of teachers through increased consultation (individual; teacher unions)

3. MATCHING POSTS AND HOLDERS

- Access of women teachers to promotional posts
- Insufficient transparency and fairness of promotional procedures
- Lack of co-ordination between teacher training and deployment

• Lack of training for promotional posts

46

- Enlarge and improve the database on holders of promotional posts
- Research on the impact of female head teachers
- Application of gender quota
- Facilitating women's access to training for promotional posts
- Better (pro-active) information on vacant promotional posts
- Critical review of the functioning of appraisal bodies
- Involving representatives from the outset
- Improving the data on teacher enrolment in inservice training (WSET)
- Establishing better structures/mechanisms of co-ordination between administrations in charge of teacher deployment and those responsible for teacher training (TT)
- Better co-ordination between TT institutions and those providing teacher support
- More school-based INSET
- Developing training for new responsibilities in promotional posts

(ii) MAJOR CHALLENGES AVENUES FOR IMPROVEMENT

1. Setting up efficient information systems

- Making databases more *relevant* and *comprehensive*
- Critical reviews of the teacher record system
- Co-ordination/uniformisation of data-bases
- Include data on actual teacher utilisation; absenteeism; transfer; class contact; actual class size etc
- More detailed data on teacher allocation & promotion by sex
- More surveys on teacher utilisation and deployment at school level
- See: DECENTRALISATION
- *Involvement* of staff at all levels concerned in the development of databases
- Training of administrators at all levels
- Critical review (audits etc.) of data/ information flow between central /regional/district school levels
- *Harmonization* of data collection forms
- Enhancing *accountability* of head teachers and district officers through incentives and disincentives through increased involvement
- More transparency through public information and debate

International Institute for Educational Planning http://www.unesco.org/iiep

• Making databases *available where needed*

- Promoting the *efficient use* of databases for teacher management
- Improving the *flow* of *information*

The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

2. Adequate decentralization

- Development and organization of *databases* for teacher management at decentralized levels
- Redistribution of staff management *tasks and responsibilities* among the different levels
- *Developing* database for teacher management at district level
- *Training* district (regional) managers in the collection, processing and use of data for TM
- *Involvement* of district managers in the development of a central database for TM
- Critical review (audits) of the *organization and functions* of regional and district offices in charge of teacher deployment and utilization
- Review of the annual staffing procedure with respect to the distribution of tasks across the different administrative levels and offices
- 3. Effective implementation of staff utilization and deployment decisions
- See Point 2.
- Improving the *accountability* of all
- Enhancing the *organization*, *resources and institutional capacities* for teacher management
- Improving the functioning of *supervisory and advisory bodies*.
- Developing_incentives and disincentives for efficient management
- *Training* of administrators at all levels in crucial areas of teacher management

Appendix I

Some major results and conclusions of the country monographs

- Botswana
- Malawi
- South Africa
- Uganda

International Institute for Educational Planning http://www.unesco.org/iiep

The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana*

by

Mr M. B. Bangale Principal Education Officer Department of Primary Education

and

Mr R. J. Motswakae Deputy Director Department of Teaching Service Management

> Ministry of Education Republic of Botswana

* Presentation to the workshop.

1. General information on Botswana

Population (1992) : 1,327,000 Population growth rate: 3.5 per cent per annum Capital: Gaborone Land area: 582,000 square kilometres GNP per capita (1991/92) P5700.00: US\$2,700.00 Year of independence: 1966 Primary school enrolment rate (1993): 83 per cent

- 1.1. Botswana is a state occupying an area of 582,000 square kilometres in Southern Africa and it is landlocked. It has a semi-arid climate and its poor soil means that agriculture is, for the most part, precarious, with the result that up to 80 per cent of its population is concentrated in the eastern 30 per cent of the country, which has comparatively good soil and adequate rainfall.
- 1.2. It is overwhelmingly dependent on external trade, primarily on beef and minerals, which then finance imports ranging from staples to luxury goods. Nominally, it owns a wealth of diamonds, but it has few effective means and ways of regulating its market since it is at the receiving end.
- 1.3. Botswana has a high demographic dependency ratio, which has serious implications especially in relation to social services and education provision, hence the Department of Teaching Service, which is the largest employing department of the Ministry of Education.

2. Management of teachers

The definition of management emphasizes that people are the most important resource available to managers. It is through this resource that all the other resources such as knowledge, finance, materials and equipment are managed. Teacher Management in Botswana is, therefore, considered an integral part of the overall process of management for which all education managers, as well as personnel specialists, are responsible. The teacher management process can then be analyzed from the point of view of the objectives, activities, strategies and policies to meet organizational requirements.

- 2.1. Primary Education is provided in partnership in Botswana. It is operated through a dual mode by the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Local Government, Lands and Housing. It is also a shared responsibility within the Ministry of Education itself, i.e. between the Department of Primary Education, the Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation (CD&E), Teacher Training and Development (TT&D) and Teaching Service Management (TSM).
- 2.2. The Ministry of Local Government Lands and Housing provides classrooms, teachers' houses, school furniture, textbooks and stationery. The Department of Curriculum Development and Evaluation provides curriculum materials and tests. The Department of Teacher Training and Development provides trained teachers. This department is also responsible for maintaining teacher motivation through centre-based workshops.

3. Teaching Service Management

The Department of Teaching Service Management, formerly known as the Unified Teaching Service, is located within the Ministry of Education. It is, however, important to understand what led to its establishment.

3.1. Prior to the establishment of the then Unified Teaching Service in April 1976, there were no less than 19 separate employers of teachers. These were the nine district councils, the four town councils, the five managers of aided secondary schools and government itself. With so many different interpretations of the law and regulations, the result was 19 areas of

conflict between employer and employees. Since each agency was an employer of teachers, they naturally competed with each other to procure the best-qualified teachers available. A situation arose where staffing of schools was determined by the success or powers of the employer as a recruiter rather than in accordance with any planned and national distribution of teachers on a national basis. This haphazard method of staffing inevitably led to unfair distribution of trained teachers between township and large villages and those in the remote rural areas. Consequently, children attending rural schools staffed with a high proportion of untrained teachers were denied the educational opportunities enjoyed by children attending better staffed schools.

- 3.2. The fragmentation of the teaching profession among 19 employers also had an adverse effect on the morale of the teachers in Botswana. It was even difficult for teachers to feel that they belonged to a profession organized on a national basis and working towards achievement of the same national objectives in education. It was even difficult to create or develop a fair and reasonable career service structure for teachers. Movements of teachers from one district or town council was not easy, as such teachers had to resign first and apply for employment in another district or town council. These then were some of the main reasons for government's decision to establish the Unified Teaching Service.
- 3.3. The Unified Teaching Service Act, and its related regulations, provided a framework for a career structure in which teachers can develop their professional abilities to the fullest and also make a meaningful contribution to the development of the country. Over the years, the Teaching Service has forged closer ties with the Botswana Public Service and the Unified Local Government Service. Each of these services has, of course, to cater for its own peculiarities but, as far as is possible, the terms and conditions of service have been made uniform, mainly to prevent one group of employees feeling that it is treated differently from the others.

54

3.4. The Unified Teaching Service Act makes the Service the sole employer of all the teachers at primary, secondary, teacher training colleges and colleges of education, except for teachers in private schools. The finding of the Commission on Education in 1976 and the Organization and Methods Review Report have helped to further reorganize and restructure the department. This has not only resulted in the change of the department's name to Teaching Service Management, but also in the creation of a logical structure within which functions can be distributed and authority delegated in an effective manner. This has also resulted in the broadening of the scope and role of the Teaching Service Management. It is this Department that is responsible for the employment and conditions of service for teachers, as discussed below.

4. Recruitment and initial training

Generally, teachers are recruited from a pool of trained personnel. The primary-school teachers have in the past been trained only to certificate level and almost all would have had an academic education of up to Junior Certificate. This tended to bring about serious disparities in the levels of understanding of both content and principles of education as a discipline.

This again reduced the self-esteem of the teachers of primary schools and created a gap between them and their colleagues at secondary level. It had been difficult consequently for the two groups to concentrate collectively on professional matters that could improve the education standards across the whole education spectrum. As a step to improve quality, the University of Botswana introduced a Bachelor of Education and Diploma programmes in 1981 to further in-service training of primary school teachers and two Primary Teachers Colleges have been recently converted to offer a diploma programme for primary-school teachers. The remaining two teacher's colleges will also soon be converted to diploma-offering colleges.

5. Teacher by qualification and sex

- 5.1. The total number of teachers increased from 9,445 in 1995 to 9,875 by June 1996. Trained teachers had increased by 63 university completers by June 1996. It is therefore difficult to subtract those untrained teachers who have been displaced by university graduates, according to sex, in the column of 'untrained' above, hence the 63 which is subtracted from the subtotal.
- 5.2. The level of teachers' qualifications is expected to increase, due to the upgrading of teacher training colleges for primary teachers.
- 5.3. The majority of the teachers are in the age range of 26 to 35 years. This age range constitutes about 50 per cent of the whole population of primary-school teachers.
- 5.4. The other interesting scenario is that of male and female teachers in primary education. Female teachers constitute about 83 per cent. It has not yet been established why such a scenario exists. It is only through the conduct of a survey or research that reasons could be established as to why such a phenomenon exists.

6. Summary of private primary-school teachers by qualifications and sex

There is a component of private schools in primary education, as summarized above. These private schools are made up of schools owned by individuals, companies and Village Development Committees (VDCs). The English Medium Schools are mainly characterized by trained teachers, whereas the Botswana Private primary schools are mainly characterized by untrained teachers and poor facilities. As in the government and government-aided schools, the majority of children are enrolled at Standard one, composing 16 per cent of the total enrolment. Even in the private schools, female teachers are in the majority, numbering 456 (77 per cent), when males account for only 140 (23 per cent).

7. Deployment

The teaching force in the primary schools is almost 99 per cent localized. The Teaching Service Management, as the employer, recruits teachers mainly from the local training institutions and then allocates them to Regions. Once in the regions, teachers are then allocated to district Senior Education Officers. The senior education officers assign individual teachers to schools in accordance with their needs, under the supervision of the head teachers.

- 7.1. The movements of teachers within the districts and regions are authorized by the respective senior education officers, in consultation with the Regional Education Officer. Interregional transfers/movements are sanctioned by the Teaching Service Management.
- 7.2. However, all transfers of promoted staff, whether within or outside the district or region, have to be sanctioned by the Department of Teaching Service Management.

8. Promotion

The promotion of teachers at whatever level or position is the responsibility of the Department of Teaching Service Management. The promotion is not only based on seniority, but also on merit.

8.1. The Supervisory Officers play a very important role in screening and recommending teachers. Posts are advertised nationally and those teachers

who believe they have the required qualifications apply and are then short-listed before the names are forwarded to the TSM with the supervisory officer's comments.

8.2. For positions above Senior Teacher Grade 1, it is necessary to attend an interview. Even though the posts are advertised nationally, interviews are held in various regions. Only teachers who have been short-listed are invited to be interviewed by the Mobile Interview Board. The Interview Board consists of the Deputy Director, TSM who chairs, the Assistant Director (Procurement and Placement), who serves as Secretary to the Board, the Assistant Director (Administration), one Principal Education Officer from the Primary Education Department, Regional Education Officer (Primary), Regional Education Officer (Secondary) and the Principal Education Secretary.

9. Conditions of service and teacher incentives

The last National Commission on Education established that in terms of salaries, teachers are on a par with and, in some cases, have an edge over, their counterparts in public offices. What has been lacking is a career structure that opens up more promotional opportunities for teachers.

9.1. The Commission further established that teachers were entitled to a number of benefits such as feeding time following maternity, paid maternity leave, hotel occupancy for 14 days, leave travel concession, subsistence allowance, car allowance if on D4 or above, and reimbursement for use of own vehicle on official trips. Paid study leave for the first 12 months on full salary was also an entitlement. However, most teachers seem to be unaware of their fringe benefits, partly because most of them do not read circulars and documents sent to schools publicizing these fringe benefits, and mainly because some of the information is not extensively disseminated to schools, especially to those in rural schools.

10. Improvement that teachers should expect

With the establishment of the Teaching Service Management and its consequent reorganization and restructuring, the service is in a better position to focus its energy on the improvement of teachers' conditions of service. The UTS (Unified Teaching Service) Act and its regulations are under review and will soon be published as soon as it has passed through the Attorney General's Chambers. Most important is the development, for the first time, of the schemes of service incorporating parallel progression, and how they are going to affect teachers, as detailed below.

- 10.1. Parallel progression came about as a result of the acceptance by government of the Recommendation No. 4.76 of the Presidential Commission on the Review of Income Policy. The main aim of the Recommendation is to encourage Botswana teachers to train and remain in areas of relative scarcity of manpower, by enhancing their entry salary points and also affording them an opportunity to progress, parallel to the administrative cadres, to the highest salary scale possible.
- 10.2. It is simply an attempt to provide a career ladder to teachers and other specifically identified officers by giving them a chance to progress to the top. In as far as teachers are concerned, their progress is going to be determined by the level of operation, while qualification will determine entry salary point, irrespective of level of operations. Five levels of operations have been identified, as explained in Figures 1 and 2 of the Appendices.

11. Conclusion

The conditions of service of teachers in Botswana have been improving since the inception of the Teaching Service Management, formerly known as the Unified Teaching Service. There have been a number of interventions by government to bring them on par with the civil service. In particular, the implementation of the revised national policy on education will, hopefully, not only improve the conditions of teachers, but also bring about a better way of deploying and managing teachers at all levels.

References

- 1. Botswana Government. 1992. *O and M Review*; Report on Ministerial Organization Review; Ministry of Education (overall). Gaborone: Government Printer.
- 2. Botswana Government. 1976. *Unified Teaching Service Regulations*. Gaborone: Government Printer.
- 3. Botswana Government. 1967. *Education Act*. Gaborone: Government Printer.
- 4. Khan, J. 1991. *Public administration in the Eastern Caribbean*. Typescript.
- 5. Warrington, Edward. 1994. A capacity for policy management: Re: appraising the context in micro-states. Asian Journal of Public Administration, Vol.16, No.1: 109-133.

Main policies aimed at addressing teacher deployment problems in Malawi

by

Mr H. Mchazime Malawi German Basic Education Project Zomba

and

Mr H. Siege Malawi German Basic Education Project Zomba

Main policies aimed at addressing teacher deployment problems

The Ministry of Education is only partly aware of the problems regarding teacher deployment in the country. Among other things, it is aware that there is an acute shortage of qualified teachers and that teachers need some incentives and training opportunities. It is also aware that some districts have better pupil/teacher ratios than others. A number of policy initiatives are being put in place to address the problems. Nevertheless there seems to be a serious deficit in problem awareness in regard to the imbalances in teacher deployment between schools or the demand for teachers in the future. This deficit is certainly based on the lack of knowledge of what is actually the status of teacher deployment and utilization in the country. Only recently the Ministry of Education, with the assistance of the local donor group on education, embarked on a policy of enhancing its management information system, thus trying to provide the necessary information for teacher management.

1. Teacher shortage

Shortage of primary-school teachers has been a long-standing problem in Malawi. Temporary teachers, who have been employed during the past two decades, were meant to supplement qualified teachers. Teacher education programmes have been put in place to address teacher shortages. In 1991, the government reduced the teacher training period from two years to one year. The Teacher Education Programme (MASTEP) was implemented in 1990. As of January 1997, the government was to implement the Malawi Integrated In-service Teacher Education Programme (MIITEP), which was to train

Appendix I

22,000 teachers. The programme was to be supported by the German Agency for Technical Co-operation (GTZ).

There is also a standing policy to recruit 3,000 temporary teachers every year to take care of the attrition in the system. Therefore, the recruitment and training of untrained teachers is perhaps one of the most important policies yet for minimizing the shortages of primary-school teachers in Malawi.

2. High attrition rate

The policy on the attrition rate is covered in the process of minimizing the shortage of teachers, but hampered by the lack of knowledge about the magnitude of attrition, as well as its causes. The policy to recruit 3,000 teachers a year is meant to address the attrition rate problem and the natural growth of the primary education sector. However, since death is believed to be the highest contributor to the attrition rate, and most of these deaths may well be due to HIV-related diseases, the government has introduced programmes on how to minimize AIDS-related diseases. Books on HIV and how to prevent AIDS have been written and sent to schools.

3. Imbalances

The outstanding policy on staffing is concerned with the teacher/pupil ratio of 1:60. However, it has been demonstrated in this study that there are a lot of imbalances between regions, districts and within districts. The current policy of using a quota system is meant to reduce the imbalances that exist now. Regions with lower teacher/pupil ratios get higher quotas than those with higher ratios. Within the region, districts with lower teacher/pupil ratios also get more teachers than those with higher ones.

The problem is at school level. Because posting to a school takes into consideration such factors as availability of accommodation and marital status of female teachers, the Ministry has not yet instituted any policy to address the dilemma at this level. This also applies to the drift of female teachers from rural to urban schools. Unfortunately, there seems to be a lack of public awareness about the issue of imbalances between schools which, if rectified, could prompt the Ministry of Education into action. The school communities seem to be strangely unaware of the advantages or disadvantages their children are subjected to in regard to differences in class sizes and subsequently quality of instruction.

4. Efforts to improve motivation and commitment of teachers

The Ministry of Education is aware of the problems primary-school teachers face in the schools. The various policy initiatives are generally meant to minimize these problems. These initiatives do manifest the kind of problems that teachers encounter. Among the policy initiatives are the following:

(a) Policy on promotion

The Ministry of Education restructured teachers' positions by creating new grades. There are now four grades of teachers — the highest PT1 is equivalent to a graduate professional officer (PO). The problem with the new hierarchy of posts is that there are relatively fewer posts created considering their relatively high cost.

Teachers can be promoted in two ways:

• Through an interview where posts are advertised and teachers apply to fill posts which have been created;

• Teachers can be promoted without occupying any higher substantive post. This is called 'Personal to holder'. In order to get 'personal to holder', a teacher needs to display high standards of performance. Annual reports and inspection reports are major factors that contribute to this type of teachers' promotion. However, there are not many teachers who have been promoted through this scheme. The problem appears to be the flow of information about the individual teachers from the schools to the districts and regional offices.

(b) Availability of in-service courses

The government has made provision for in-service courses for primaryschool teachers. The Domasi College of Education was designed to serve secondary teachers. Since the college started a recruitment target in primaryschool teachers, it has provided one way through which primary-school teachers hope to obtain higher qualifications. However, the problem is that graduates of the college do not return to teach in primary schools. Consequently, the system suffers because some of the best teachers are being purposely removed from primary sections. The government is also about to start sub-zonal and schoolbased in-service courses so that headteachers may be prepared for their job and other teaches sharpen their skills. This programme is supported by the Overseas Development Administration (ODA) and the German Agency for Technical Co-operation (GTZ).

(c) Creation of a Teachers' Service Commission

Parliament is about to ratify the Teachers' Service Commission. It is hoped that the new Commission will provide better working conditions of service for teachers than is the case with the current Public Service Commission's conditions of service.

5. Decentralization

In Malawi, the process of decentralization in education started with the Second Education Development Plan of 1985, shortly after the time when the World Bank endorsed decentralization policies in the sector worldwide. This plan pledged to:

"Delegate some of the administrative responsibilities to Regional and District Education Offices. It is intended that the District Education Officers should, under the direction of the Regional Education Officer, assume some co-ordination and administrative functions over all educational institutions in their districts."

The careful phrasing indicates a reluctant and not at all wholehearted approach to decentralization. Nevertheless, during the plan period 1985-1995, quite a lot happened: following a Price-Waterhouse sector review in 1988, the Department of Personnel Management and Training, in January 1991, published a 'Job inspection report'.

This report took up the two major recommendations of Price-Waterhouse, which were:

- to decentralize management functions from what was perceived to be a highly centralized system, to regional and district levels;
- to enhance the policy-making and planning capacities of the Ministry.

The Job Inspection Report by the Department of Personnel Management and Training in the Office of the President and Cabinet then made detailed proposals for the reorganization of the Ministry of Education structures, including decentralization of responsibilities and personnel. At present, the recommendations of the report are being implemented. Main features of the enacted decentralization process are so far:

- strengthening the regional offices by decentralizing the Inspectorate and accounting from the HQ to the Regions;
- strengthening the districts by decentralizing the District Inspectorate in Zones and Sub-Zones and increasing the number of District Inspectors (now called Primary Education Advisers (PEA));
- strengthening the districts by providing them with a budget allocation;
- (the proposal of the 10-year development plan to include all educational institutions into the responsibility of the district was never pursued. Thus the district remains a primary education district).

6. Teachers' accommodation

One of the major problems in primary schools is accommodation. In urban schools, there is usually one house at the school which is normally allocated to the headteacher. Schools in rural areas have some accommodation, but in the majority of cases not enough houses are available for every teacher. Consequently, the government policy on accommodation is that teachers who do not have accommodation at school are given 15 per cent of their annual salary as housing allowance. With this money, teachers can rent houses. Housing allowance is a new initiative that is designed to address the problem of accommodation and to act as an incentive for the teachers. Another policy is that instead of pushing the responsibility of building teachers' houses to communities only, government will in future provide at least one house at every new school.

International Institute for Educational Planning http://www.unesco.org/iiep

The deployment, utilization and management of teachers: South Africa in transition (1995/1996)

by

Dr Jane Hofmeyr

and

Ms Ross Jaff

National Business Initiative for Growth, Development and Democracy

The deployment, utilization and management of teachers: South Africa in transition (1995/1996) – overview

1. Overview of the South African schooling system

South Africa has a 12-year system (seven primary, five secondary schooling). Most of the South African schools are state schools. Only 2 per cent are private. Schools are under the authority of the national ministry (Department of Education) and nine provincial education departments. The languages of instruction used in primary schools are the local vernacular and English.

The level of expenditure on education is relatively high, i.e. 24 per cent of the state budget and 7.3 per cent of the GDP.

2. Governance of teacher supply, utilization and development

At national level, the Department of Education sets the norms and standards to be applied countrywide to the management of teachers (i.e. teacher qualification, recruitment, staffing, remuneration, etc.).

The nine provincial departments of education are the employing authorities of primary teachers. They are in charge of defining the provincial policies and strategies of policy implementation and the management of schools and colleges. Teacher support is organized and managed at district level. In South Africa, the school level also plays an important role in teacher management: the governing bodies of schools decide, for example, on teacher appointments; furthermore, teacher appraisal is under the responsibility of the school principal and a team of external evaluators. Overall, the South African system of school governance is a blend of centralization and decentralization.

3. Profile of teaching corps

In 1994/95, there were 341,903 state school teachers and 7,000 private school teachers in South Africa.

All teachers are part of the civil service. They have the right to strike. Two-thirds of them possess the formally required qualifications (Secondary Leaving Certificate + three years and above). Of the teaching staff, 64 per cent are female.

Most teachers (71 per cent) are African, 15 per cent are white, 11 per cent coloured and 4 per cent Indian. The South African teaching staff is relatively young: more than half are less than 35 years old and one-third have less than five years' experience.

4. Teacher development

The pre-service training of teachers constitutes a fragmented and highly diverse field in which the state, private and non-governmental organizations (churches, etc.) run a variety of programmes (in both contact and distance mode). Inefficiencies and the uneven quality of pre-service teacher training (PRESET) in all respects recently led to the definition of new PRESET norms The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

and standards and the decision to set up a more outcome-oriented system of management in this sector.

There is also ongoing reflection on the appropriate balance and articulation between PRESET and in-service training for the future. In-service training of teachers has been organized on a large scale since the beginning of the 1990s. However, its provision has remained unco-ordinated. Other weaknesses observed are the lack of follow-up and support of teachers having undergone such programmes.

5. Condition and utilization of teachers

The staffing of primary and secondary schools follows national norms. Recently, the government adopted a new grading system for schools/colleges which is based on size and complexity. Staffing norms are set accordingly.

Pupils/teacher ratios are 40:1 for primary and 35:1 for secondary schools, according to the official norm. In practice, there are significant variations of the pupils/teacher (PTR) and pupils/class ratios (PCR), particularly between African and white schools, to the detriment of the first (PCR=47 for African, 26 for white primary schools). Furthermore, geographical imbalances in teacher distribution have to be noted (e.g. oversupply in Gauteng and Western Cape; undersupply in Kwazulu-Natal and Eastern Cape). With 6 per cent, the annual teacher attrition rate became relatively high in 1995.

Teachers have an average workload of 200 days per year. Their salaries are rather high compared to other countries of the region. A new salary scale was negotiated in the mid-1990s which resulted in handsome increases in teacher remuneration. A major question is whether the present level of teacher remuneration will not become unaffordable in the future.

Another concern relates to the lack of incentives built into the present system of management: criticisms relate in particular to the fact that staff remuneration depends almost exclusively on the formal qualifications and that there is only one single career path for teachers at present.

Another open issue relating to teacher utilization is the existence of 'temporary' teachers who have actually been employed on a permanent basis over many years. Furthermore, the selection and preparation for promotion posts (e.g. the post of school head) is considered as unsatisfactory: women remain under-represented at management levels and in many primary schools the head/principal does not have the qualification and/or training required for the post.

6. Teacher management — Summary of major challenges

Teacher management in the post-Apartheid era faces a number of serious challenges. Some of them relate to the administrative legacy of the Apartheid era, in particular:

- the need to merge previously distinct administrations and to right-size the unified civil service;
- many vacancies, particularly in African schools;
- the lack of experience of new officials in educational administrations;
- overload of the experienced top officials at federal and provincial levels;
- unclear responsibilities of the district level;
- the need to re-vamp the image and the role of inspectors;
- the open challenge of teacher evaluation and appraisal (by whom and how?).

In brief, the management system in transition is characterized by a move towards more decentralization and greater democratization, but it has not yet become efficient in practice. Its future development will have to take into account the following major strengths and weaknesses:

(a) Major weaknesses:

- the absence of a national vision and mission for teacher supply, utilization and development;
- poor alignment between teacher supply, utilization and development in practice;
- despite national norms, huge differences in policy implementation and management across and within the different provinces and formerly district school administrations;
- politicization and erosion of accountability;
- poor communication between administrations and school level;
- neglect of management training at the different levels of educational administration;
- lack of capacity and consequent inefficiency of officials;
- absence of a national database for human resource management in the education sector;
- mismatch between promotional posts and incumbents;
- inadequate incentives for good management performance;
- lack of administrative and professional support for teachers.

(b) Strengths of the existing system:

- a significant core of dedicated, competent officials and teachers;
- the move to democratization;
- increasing decentralization;
- more equitable deployment of teachers and officials across the different schools and areas of the country;
- the active role of teacher organizations in policy-making (which sometimes, however, tends to slow down or hamper the decision-making process);

- full recognition of teacher rights;
- adequate salaries and good benefits for teachers;
- assurance of coherence of teacher management practices through national norms and standards;
- development of innovative approaches to teacher appointment, promotion, evaluation/appraisal;
- setting up of new management information systems.

The deployment, utilization and management of primary teachers in Uganda

by

Mr Joseph Eilor Education Officer, Education Planning Unit

and

Mr Sam B. Onek Assistant Commissioner, Primary and Secondary Education

Ministry of Education

The deployment, utilization and management of primary teachers in Uganda*

The deployment and management of primary teachers in Uganda presents both opportunities and challenges.

Opportunities can be discerned from the country's policy framework and political commitment, which both recognize the valuable contribution of primary teachers to national development. As testimony to this commitment, for instance, a primary education reform programme, whose main focus is on primary teachers, is being implemented enthusiastically throughout the country. The major components of this programme include teacher training; provision of instructional materials; improvement of the work environment; motivation; and reinforcing teacher-support systems.

Major challenges that will continue to be encountered by the system in the near future include: resource constraints; inadequate teacher administrative and management structures; a substantial number of untrained teachers; unsatisfactory remuneration and teacher motivation systems; unrealistic terms and conditions of teacher service; inadequate teaching facilities and materials; and a hostile work environment.

Lessons learned

From this analysis of deployment and management of primary teachers in Uganda, the following lessons have been learned:

* Extract from the country monograph entitled *The deployment and management of primary teachers in Uganda* by Joseph Eilor.

- The function of teacher deployment and management of primary teachers in Uganda is shared between the central and district/local governments. The central government controls policy formulation and training of teachers, while the local government controls deployment and management of primary teachers.
- Prior to the decentralization of some aspects of teacher deployment and • management to the districts, all functions were performed at the Ministry of Education headquarters. Over the years, however, the function of primary-teacher deployment became over centralized. The advantages of such a policy were: it was sensitive to the issue of equity in the distribution of qualified teachers; it permitted central control of teacher quality; it was possible to pay teachers a uniform rate without fear of serious disparities; it provided teachers with easy access to in-service training; it also encouraged national integration (i.e. unity in diversity); the capital outlay required to run a primary teacher deployment system was smaller; and there was uniformity of policy guidelines emanating from the centre. The policy was not without disadvantages and the major ones include: as the system expanded, effective supervision from the centre diminished; enforcement of discipline and work ethics became inadequate; there were delays in handling teachers' problems and most decisions were made on faulty grounds; it undermined the need for capacity building at the district level, which has now become a problem; it denied community involvement in teacher support and this tended to alienate the schools(teachers) from the communities; and communication between the centre and the districts became poor.
- Because of the shortcomings of over-centralization of teacher deployment and management, government has embarked on a new policy of decentralization. This policy partly shifts some of the major responsibilities of primary teacher deployment and management to the districts/local government. The aim of the policy is to take services nearer to the beneficiaries.

The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

The major advantages of this policy are: it enhances effective communication particularly on teacher records, which eliminates the phenomenon of 'ghost teachers'; it encourages speedy handling of teachers' issues; it permits involvement of the communities in teacher-support systems; it encourages capacity building at the local level where it is most needed; discipline and work ethics can easily be enforced; it encourages effective monitoring, supervision and evaluation of teacher performance; it encourages effective planning for expansion and location of new primary schools; it facilitates timely promotion, discipline and in-service training; and it enhances accountability among primary teachers.

However, decentralization policy also generates new problems which include lack of equity in the distribution of trained teachers; inequalities in teacher remuneration and reward systems; undermining national integration; requires huge capital outlay to run; interpretation and enforcement of central policies becomes a serious problem; and it makes it difficult to ensure uniformity in teacher quality, particularly as the districts take on the responsibility of primary teacher training.

Is deployment and management of primary teachers in Uganda satisfactory or not?

The system for deployment and management of primary teachers in Uganda certainly leaves plenty of room for improvement. The analysis of the system has revealed that there are many institutional obstacles to be overcome before the system is expected to work perfectly. Some of these obstacles include an inadequate policy framework for the implementation of teacher deployment and management; inadequate teacher-support systems; limited financial and human resources to implement policies; weak teacher management structures, particularly at the district level; limited statutory powers conferred upon the Education Service Commission; and general lack of accountability at all levels within the system.

Leading issues that have emerged

- The Teacher Management Information System (TMIS) in Uganda is inadequate and presents a major problem. It is not possible to capture reliable information on deployment and management of primary teachers because the teacher records system is still quite poor.
- Recruitment and training of primary teachers is another problem which needs to be addressed. Because of the large demand for teachers, the teaching vacancies are being filled with an assortment of persons, many of whom are not trained.
- The Terms and Conditions of teachers' service still remain unfavourable.
- Matching teacher profiles to posts is a major problem.
- The appointment of teachers to non-existent schools (i.e. floating headteachers) is an issue that needs to be addressed urgently.
- The powers of the district education Service Committees needs to be enlarged and reinforced to adequately handle the challenges of teacher deployment and management.
- Regular in-service training for primary headteachers needs to be emphasized.
- The present routine management practices and the reward system are unsatisfactory and have accentuated teacher deployment and management problems in the country.

Recommendations for action

- 1. The Teacher Management Information System should be improved so that it is capable of capturing, analyzing, storing, and disseminating timely and reliable information on teacher deployment and management. The collection of various statistics on teachers should, therefore, be institutionalized and sustained at all levels of the teacher deployment and management system.
- 2. The Ministry of Education's attention should be drawn to the issues pertaining to recruitment and training of teachers through in-service programmes to ensure quality of teachers selected for deployment.
- 3. The newly drafted Terms and Conditions of Service for primary teachers should be piloted first before they are implemented. This will permit testing for their general acceptability by ironing out areas of contention, thus ensuring their successful implementation.
- 4. The Government of Uganda should ultimately attend to the issue of teachers' welfare, including provision of decent staff housing and sanitation.
- 5. The routine management practices and the reward system for primary teachers should be reviewed to respond to current challenges of the system.
- 6. The matching of teacher profiles to various post requirements should be enforced and carried out objectively to mitigate demotivational effects and disparities in teacher distribution.

Annex II

List of participants

IIEP/DSE Sub-regional Workshop on The Utilization, Deployment and Management of Teachers Magaliesburg, South Africa, 24 to 28 June, 1996

List of participants

BOTSWANA

Mr. Milton BANGALE Principal Education Officer Department of Primary Education Ministry of Education Private Bag 005 GABORONE Tel. No. (267) 3600400 Fax No. (267) 3600458

Ms. Kgomotso MOTLOTLE Principal Education Officer Teacher Training and Development Ministry of Education Private Bag 005 GABORONE Tel. No. (267) 3600400 Fax No. (267) 3600458

Mr. Rueben MOTSWAKAE Deputy Director Teaching Service Management Department Ministry of Education Private Bag 005 GABORONE Tel. No. (267) 3600400 Fax No. (267) 3600458

84

Appendix II

MALAWI

Mr. Bester KALOMBO Deputy Secretary for Education Ministry of Education Private Bag 328 LILONGWE Tel. (265) 784800 Fax (265) 782873

Mr. Francis MABEDI Assistant Education Officer P.O. Box 311 ZOMBA c/o GTZ Zomba: Tel. (265) 523065 or (265) 821698 Fax (265) 522899

Mr. Hannes SIEGE GTZ Malawi German Basic Education Project Zomba German Technical Co-operation (GTZ) P.O. Box 655 ZOMBA Tel. (265) 523065 or (265) 821698 Fax (265) 522899

SOUTH AFRICA

Ms. Carol COOMBE Member, Task Team on Education Management Development Department of Education JOHANNESBURG Tel (27) (11) 403-6131 Fax (27 (11) 403-1130 / 339-3455 The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

SOUTH AFRICA (cont'd)

Mr. Jonathan GODDEN Chairman Task Team on Education Management Development Department of Education JOHANNESBURG Tel. (27) (11) 403-6131 Fax (27) (11) 403-1130/339-3455

Ms. Jane HOFMEYR National Business Initiative (NBI) 17th Floor, Metal Box Centre 25 Owl Street AUCKLAND PARK 2092 Tel. (27) (11) 482-5100 Fax (27) (11) 482-5507

Ms. Ros. JAFF National Business Initiative (NBI) 17th Floor, Metal Box Centre 25 Owl Street AUCKLAND PARK 2092 Tel. (27) (11) 482-5100 Fax (27) (11) 482-5507

Mr. J.J. MABENA Deputy Director: General Education Department of Education Private Bag X251863 MIDDELBURG 1050 Tel. (27) (132) 432170 Fax (27 (132) 432321

86

Appendix II

SOUTH AFRICA (cont'd)

Mr. James MASEKO Head Gauteng Department of Education 111 Commissioner Street JOHANNESBURG 2000 Tel. (27) (11) 355 0000 Fax (27) (11) 333 5548

Mr. Pieter MORKEL Acting Chief Director: Human Resources Department of Education Private Bag X895 PRETORIA 0001 Tel. (27) (12) 312 5370 Fax (27) (12) 328 7199

UGANDA

Mr. Joseph EILOR Educational Planner Ministry of Education Crested Towers P.O. Box 7063 KAMPALA Tel. (254) (41) 258629 Fax. (256) (41) 244394 // 230658 // 232104 The utilization, deployment and management of teachers in Botswana, Malawi, South Africa and Uganda

UGANDA (cont'd)

Mr. S. B. ONEK Assistant Commissioner for Education Ministry of Education and Sports **Crested Towers** P.O. Box 7063 **KAMPALA** Tel. (256) (41) 234440 Fax. (256) (41) 244394 // 230658 // 232104

Mr. OPIKA OPOKA H.S. Permanent Secretary Ministry of Education **Crested Towers** P.O. Box 7063 **KAMPALA** Tel. (256) (41) 257038 Fax. (256) (41) 257869

ORGANIZERS

Deutsche Stiftung für Internationale Entwicklung (DSE) – German Foundation for International Development

Dr. Udo BUDE DSE/ZED Hans-Böckler Strasse 5 **D-53225 BONN** Germany Tel. (49) (228) 4001 - 0 Fax. (49) (228) 4001 111

88

International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP)

Ms. Gabriele GÖTTELMANN-DURET Programme Specialist, IIEP 7-9, rue Eugène Delacroix 75116 PARIS France Tel. (33) (1) 45.03.77.39 Fax (33) (1) 40.72.83.66

Professor Joe HOGAN IIEP Consultant on Educational Management 134 Eldon Street GREENOCK PA 16 7RS, Renfrewshire Scotland, UK Tel./Fax (44) (418) 487814

Appendix III

List of documents*

* These documents can be ordered from the International Institute for Educational Planning within the limits of the stock available

List of documents

IIEP/S.146/1	List of Documents
--------------	-------------------

- IIEP/S.146/2 Draft Programme
- IIEP/S.146/3 Provisional List of Participants
- IIEP/S.146/4 Orientation Note
- IIEP/S.146/5A Monograph on *The Deployment and Management of Teachers in Botswana* by Kgomotso Motlotle, Department of Teacher Training and Development, Ministry of Education, Botswana.
- IIEP/S.146/5BMonograph on The Deployment and Management of
Teachers in Malawi by H. Mchazime and H. Siege, Malawi
German Basic Education Project Zomba, Malawi.
- IIEP/S.146/5C Monograph on *The Deployment and Management of Teachers in South Africa*, by Jane Hofmeyr and Ross Jaff, National Business Initiative for Growth, Development and Democracy, Johannesburg.
- IIEP/S.146/5DMonograph on The Deployment and Management of
Teachers in Uganda, by Joseph Eilor, Education Planning
Unit, and Sam B. Onek, Assistant Commissioner, Primary
and Secondary Education, Ministry of Education, Uganda.

IIEP/S.146/6A	National Summary of the Main Results of the Monograph on Botswana.
IIEP/S.146/6B	National Summary of the Main Results of the Monograph on Malawi.
IIEP/S.146/6C	National Summary of the Main Results of the Monograph on South Africa.
IIEP/S.146/6D	National Summary of the Main Results of the Monograph on Uganda.
IIEP/S.146/7A	National Paper on the Annual Allocation, Posting and Transfer of Primary Teachers in Botswana.
IIEP/S.146/7B	National Paper on the Annual Allocation, Posting and Transfer of Primary Teachers in Malawi.
IIEP/S.146/7C	National Paper on the Annual Allocation, Posting and Transfer of Primary Teachers in South Africa.
IIEP/S.146/7D	National Paper on the Annual Allocation, Posting and Transfer of Primary Teachers in Uganda.
IIEP/S.146/8	<i>The Utilization, Deployment and management of Primary</i> <i>Teachers – A brief synthesis of major trends and issues</i> <i>emerging from the four country monographs</i> by G. Göttelmann-Duret, IIEP and Joe Hogan, IIEP Consultant.
IIEP/S.146/9	The Annual Staffing Exercise by Joe Hogan, IIEP Consultant.
IIEP/S.146/10	Final Report of the Workshop.

IIEP Publications and Documents

More than 1,200 titles on all aspects of educational planning have been published by the International Institute for Educational Planning. A comprehensive catalogue, giving details of their availability, includes research reports, case studies, seminar documents, training materials, occasional papers and reference books in the following subject categories:

Economics of education, costs and financing.

Manpower and employment.

Demographic studies.

Location of schools (school map) and micro-planning.

Administration and management.

Curriculum development and evaluation.

Educational technology.

Primary, secondary and higher education.

Vocational and technical education.

Non-formal, out-of-school, adult and rural education.

Disadvantaged groups.

Copies of the catalogue may be obtained from *IIEP Publications* on request.

The International Institute for Educational Planning

The International Institute for Educational Planning (IIEP) is an international centre for advanced training and research in the field of educational planning. It was established by UNESCO in 1963 and is financed by UNESCO and by voluntary contributions from Member States. In recent years the following Member States have provided voluntary contributions to the Institute: Denmark, Germany, Iceland, India, Ireland, Norway, Sweden, Switzerland and Venezuela.

The Institute's aim is to contribute to the development of education throughout the world, by expanding both knowledge and the supply of competent professionals in the field of educational planning. In this endeavour the Institute co-operates with interested training and research organizations in Member States. The Governing Board of the IIEP, which approves the Institute's programme and budget, consists of a maximum of eight elected members and four members designated by the United Nations Organization and certain of its specialized agencies and institutes.

Chairman:

Lennart Wohlgemuth (Sweden) Director, The Nordic Africa Institute, Uppsala, Sweden.

Designated Members:

David de Ferranti

Director, Human Development Department (HDD), The World Bank, Washington, USA.

Carlos Fortin

Deputy to the Secretary-General, United Nations Conference on Trade and Development (UNCTAD), Geneva, Switzerland.

Miriam J. HIRSCHFELD

Director, Division of Human Resources Development and Capacity Building, World Health Organization (WHO), Geneva, Switzerland.

Jeggan SENGHOR

Director, African Institute for Economic Development and Planning (IDEP), Dakar, Senegal.

Elected Members:

Dato'Asiah bt. Abu Samah (Malaysia)

Corporate Adviser, Lang Education, Land and General Berhad, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

Klaus Hüfner (Germany)

Professor, Freie Universität Berlin, Berlin, Germany.

Faïza Kefi (Tunisia)

President, National Union of Tunisian Women, Tunis, Tunisia.

Tamas Kozma (Hungary)

Director-General, Hungarian Institute for Educational Research, Budapest, Hungary.

Teboho Moja (South Africa)

Special Adviser to the Minister of Education, Pretoria, South Africa.

Yolanda M. Rojas (Costa Rica)

Professor, University of Costa Rica, San José, Costa Rica.

Michel Vernières (France)

Professor, University of Paris I, Panthéon-Sorbonne, Paris, France.

Inquiries about the Institute should be addressed to: The Office of the Director, International Institute for Educational Planning, 7-9 rue Eugène-Delacroix, 75116 Paris, France.